

TERMS OF REFERENCE

**FIRM FOR DEVELOPMENT OF COMPLETION
REPORT (INFRASTRUCTURE AUDIT)**

FOR

**CONTINGENCY EMERGENCY RESPONSE
COMPONENTS PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT**

UNDER

**COMPETITIVE AND LIVABLE CITY OF KARACHI
(CLICK)**

Project Implementation Unit (PIU CLICK) LGD.

Introduction and Background to the Assignment

1. The overall objective of the Competitive and Livable City of Karachi (CLICK) Project, implemented by and under the auspices of the Government of Sindh with the financial support of the World Bank, is to improve the performance of Karachi Local Councils and agencies in urban management, financing, and service delivery; improve the provision of municipal infrastructure, and improve the business environment for private sector development in Karachi.
2. To achieve these objectives, the CLICK project has been classified into four distinct components:
 1. Performance-based grants and capacity development for Local Councils
 2. Modernization of the urban property tax administration and system
 3. Improvement of city competitiveness and business environment
 4. Technical assistance for solid waste management

The 2022 abnormal monsoon season lashed Karachi crippling routine life and mobility. As a result, the CLICK project was on halt for a short span of time. As Karachi is an industrial city, that is why due to the urban flooding in Karachi, massive economic loss is faced by the country, not just Karachi itself. Excessive flooding hindered their jobs and businesses resulting in the disturbance of the economy.

Infrastructure including bridges, highways, and roads have been damaged, disrupting traffic and upending the lives of millions across Karachi. Torrential rain caused widespread flooding in Karachi. Most underpasses were flooded, and there was nowhere to pump the water out to Karachi's main streets which caused massive destruction to road infrastructure in Karachi.

The Government of Sindh (GoS) under its Secretary to Local Government Department (LGD) has made significant efforts to combat the damage caused by un-usual rains in the city. A comprehensive plan has been prepared, i.e., "Response and Recovery Plan" with short to medium-term schemes and sub-schemes covering the devastation caused by heavy and un-usual rains in the city of Karachi.

Upon the request Government of Sindh, an amount of 27 million USD was repurposed from the CLICK project allocated to the rain emergency road repair works. Thus, the Contingency Emergency Reponses Component was activated.

The main objective of the CERC was to rehabilitate road infrastructure in Karachi damaged by floods of the 2022 abnormal monsoon season. In the medium to long term, these activities will increase mobility in the city and improve road infrastructure. The emergency response activities – the road rehabilitation works- are expected to benefit over 2 million people.

The plan has been prepared and prioritized by Local Councils (LCs) including the Karachi Metropolitan Commission (KMC) for emergency works executed in Karachi on the roads and drainage infrastructure of Karachi. The prioritized plan has estimated a total of 2,614,460 square meters of patchwork required with an estimated cost of Rs 6,875.82 million. The work has been allocated to a number of agencies/Departments working under the LGD, which include:

- People Bus Service
- Annual Development Plan Karachi Development Authority (KDA)
- Karachi Metropolitan Cooperation (KMC)
- Karachi Neighborhood Improvement Project (KNIP)
- Sindh Infrastructure Development Company Ltd. (SIDCL)

– Competitive Livable City of Karachi Project (CLICK)

Competitive Livable City of Karachi Project (CLICK) was assigned to repair approximately 310 based on preliminary assessments. The overall responsibility for coordination of the CERC activities remained with the CLICK Project Implementation Unit. Karachi Municipal Corporation was tasked with the implementation of the CERC action plan. Through a third party, PIU CLICK was also responsible for the design supervision and monitoring of emergency road repair works. The CLICK LGD-PIU CLICK was also managing the preparation of necessary safeguard documents (environment and social screening reports and environment (ESSRs) and environment and social management plans (ESMPs)) for the planned emergency works.

Objective

1. To assess and evaluate the overall performance of the Contingency Emergency Response Component against its intended outcomes (project development and results framework. This includes examining the relevance, efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and impact of the CERC.
2. To review the processes and implementation mechanisms used during project execution including coordination, procurement, financial management, monitoring systems, risk management, etc., and determine their effectiveness.
3. To identify challenges faced, determine factors that contributed to intended or unintended outcomes, and document lessons learned to guide future project design and implementation.
4. To gather evidence-based qualitative and quantitative data through interviews, field observations, surveys, etc. for the CERC project completion report.

Scope of Services

The scope of work for the present assignment shall comprise but not be limited to the following:

- Desk Review: Review all relevant project documents including the project appraisal document, loan agreement, emergency action plan, implementation plan, progress reports, monitoring reports, financial reports, etc.
- Field Visits: Conduct site visits to project locations to observe first-hand completed road repair infrastructure, interaction with beneficiaries, etc. Interview relevant stakeholders such as project staff, contractors, community members, local administration, and beneficiaries.
- Data Analysis: Assess project performance and results against the stated project development & and intermediate objectives: **1) People with access to improved road conditions 2) Specific Operations Manual prepared and adopted for the crisis response 3) Number of roads rehabilitated 4) Beneficiaries covered under the activated crisis response** against the project endline targets. Evaluate the efficacy, efficiency, sustainability, and impacts using quantitative and qualitative analysis.
- Assessment: Assess relevance, efficacy, and efficiency of project design, implementation, stakeholder participation, risk management, financial management, procurement, sustainability of outcomes, and institutional capacity building.

- Lessons Learned: Identify challenges, bottlenecks, strengths, weaknesses, successes, failures, unintended outcomes, and lessons learned with a view to improving future project design and implementation.

Engineering Aspects

- Based on random samples (at least 10% of the total work done) the road repair/patchworks to ensure technical specifications and quality standards were met as per the contract.
- Spot-check road measurements, materials used in road repair and rehabilitation works, etc.
- Review work diaries, inspection logs, and quality control test results for patchwork.
- Interview contractors, supervising engineers, quality inspectors, and other relevant personnel.
- Assess and determine if the completed works align with design standards, technical specifications, bill of quantities, quality requirements, and good engineering practices.
- Document deficiencies or flaws noticed and quantify substandard works.
- Compile findings through detailed field notes, photographs, sketches, measurements, and documentation.
- Reporting: Develop and submit a high-quality completion report as per the World Bank's guidelines and outline.
- Incorporate feedback from stakeholders on draft reports before finalization.

Deliverables of the Firm

Inception Report: This should detail the evaluators' understanding of the assignment, evaluation methodology, data collection tools and analysis methods to be used, and a proposed work plan.

Draft Project Completion Report: This report should comprehensively cover all aspects laid out in the scope of work as per World Bank guidelines. It should include findings, analysis, lessons learned, and recommendations.

Final Project Completion Report: This should incorporate feedback from relevant stakeholders on the draft report. The final report will be submitted at the end of the assignment period.

Duration of the Consultancy

Expected Duration: The assignment is expected to be completed over a period of 2 months.

Qualification of the Firm

- At least 10 years of experience in designing and conducting project evaluations for international organizations, emergency projects rapid appraisals, baselines, and end-line surveys, especially in a flood emergency context.
- Experience in public sector inter-agency coordination and collaboration in flood emergency context.
- Familiarity with the World Bank's policies, procedures and guidelines.
- Extensive experience in the relevant sector/thematic areas

- Demonstrated skills in data analysis report writing and impact evaluations.

Documents to be provided by the Client

1. Project Appraisal Document (PAD) of World Bank
2. CLICK Emergency Action Plan
3. Up-to-date and current Project Implementation Manual (PIM) (relevant sections), as well as any applicable and updated versions of PIM during project implementation, as and when available
4. Environmental Management Framework (EMF) of the Project
5. Social Management Framework (EMF) of the Project, including Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF)
6. Any other material considered relevant during the conduct of this assignment